

26-Nov-2017

Dear Dr. Srour

Manuscript ID BMJ.2017.040538.R1 entitled "Consumption of ultra-processed foods and cancer risk: results from the NutriNet-Santé prospective cohort"

Thank you for sending us your paper. We sent it to one of the original reviewers who raised some questions. We hope very much that you will be willing and able to revise your paper as explained below in the report, so that we will be in a better position to understand your study and decide whether the BMJ is the right journal for it. We are looking forward to reading the revised version and, we hope, reaching a decision.

Yours sincerely,

Daoxin Yin
dyin@bmj.com

*** PLEASE NOTE: This is a two-step process. After clicking on the link, you will be directed to a webpage to confirm. ***

https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/bmj?URL_MASK=71c368b92a6c444a9fe38b73d5cc3ae3

** Comments from the external peer reviewers**

Reviewer: 1

Recommendation:

Comments:

The authors try to clarify what is ultra-processed food; however, the definition is still not clear and hard to distinguish with those of not ultra-processed food.

The western dietary pattern was derived from the dietary intake and the dietary lipid, sodium, carbohydrate were also derived from dietary intake. They were both adjusted in model 4.

The author adjusted the fruits and vegetable intake. Fruits and vegetable contributed to 15% of the ultra-processed food. How did the author deal with overlap-consideration?

Since the author added the mediation analysis which is complex. So can you show the detailed table of such results?

The author said " 5% of values were missing and were imputed to the modal value". How did the author impute? with which method?

The author added the sensitivity analysis and stratified analysis, the results is based on which model? which confounders are adjusted?

In appendix 2, the health pattern the first dominant factor and the western pattern is the second factor. Please specify the variance and proportion explained by each factor, which were extracted from the principal component analysis.

Additional Questions:

Please enter your name: LIU XUDONG

Job Title: Research Associate

Institution: Chinese University of Hong Kong

Reimbursement for attending a symposium?: No

A fee for speaking?: No

A fee for organising education?: No

Funds for research?: No

Funds for a member of staff?: No

Fees for consulting?: No

Have you in the past five years been employed by an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this paper?: No

Do you hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this paper?: No

If you have any competing interests (please see BMJ policy) please declare them here: