

BMJ -  
Decision  
on  
Manuscript  
ID  
BMJ.2016.  
035852

**Body:** 27-Mar-2017

Dear Dr. Vong

# BMJ.2016.035852 entitled "Developing a situation analysis tool to assess containment of antimicrobial resistance in South East Asia"

Thank you for sending us your article, which we read with interest.

We do not consider it suitable for publication in its present form but if you are able to amend it in the light of our and/or reviewers' comments, we would be happy to consider it again.

The reviewers' comments are at the end of this letter.

The editors' comments are listed below:

Suggestions for ALL articles in the antimicrobial resistance collection:

- We do not expect the article to be an overview of literature or to be exhaustive.
- We would like authors to synthesise this information and present an analytical angle that is engaging and interesting to a general medical readership based all over the world
- We suggest you have a clear central argument for what's required, challenge the status quo, provoke and stimulate, and pull out what is interesting and relevant about this topic for non-specialist readers
- Give as much weight to solutions/way forward as to the issues/problems
- Focus on what's uniquely relevant to the region
- Consider cross-cutting regional approaches: what can the region do together?
- Analysis articles are typically 2000 words in length with

20 references, and we ask that you keep as close to this as possible.

Specific suggestions for this article:

The focus on the paper is how they developed the tool and how it compares to other tools in use. We think our readers will be interested in a broader discussion and suggest revising using the following format:

- 1 Context about AMR and the need for monitoring
- 2 Brief methods
- 3 Critical analysis of the strengths and weaknesses of the current monitoring approaches.
- 4 Outline of the role of tools to support monitoring.
- 5 Analysis of the different tools and their strengths and weaknesses (i.e. all the others that aren't the SEARO tool).
- 6 Brief description of the SEARO tool and what problems it solves
- 7 Recommendations on how monitoring can be improved in the region including recommendations about the tools.

We hope that you will be able to revise the paper and send it back within three weeks. When submitting your revised manuscript please provide a point by point response to our comments and those of any reviewers.

Please note that resubmitting your manuscript does not guarantee eventual acceptance, and that your resubmission may be sent again for review.

Once you have revised your manuscript, go to <https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/bmj> and login to your Author Center. Click on "Manuscripts with Decisions," and then click on "Create a Resubmission" located next to the

manuscript number. Then, follow the steps for resubmitting your manuscript.

You may also click the below link to start the resubmission process (or continue the process if you have already started your revision) for your manuscript. If you use the below link you will not be required to login to ScholarOne Manuscripts.

\*\*\* PLEASE NOTE: This is a two-step process. After clicking on the link, you will be directed to a webpage to confirm. \*\*\*

[https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/bmj?URL\\_MASK=64962fcdfa5746399ff8236314548e7e](https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/bmj?URL_MASK=64962fcdfa5746399ff8236314548e7e)

IMPORTANT: Your original files are available to you when you upload your revised manuscript. Please delete any redundant files before completing the submission.

I hope you will find the comments useful. Please don't hesitate to contact me if you wish to discuss this further.

Yours sincerely

Navjoyt Ladher  
nladher@bmj.com

**\*\*IMPORTANT INFORMATION TO INCLUDE IN A RESUBMISSION\*\***

Instead of returning a signed licence or competing interest form, we require all authors to insert the following statements into the text version of their manuscript:

Licence for Publication

The Corresponding Author has the right to grant on behalf of all authors and does grant on behalf of all authors, an exclusive licence (or non exclusive for government employees) on a worldwide basis to the BMJ Publishing Group Ltd to permit this article (if accepted) to be published in BMJ and any other BMJ PGL products and

sublicences such use and exploit all subsidiary rights, as set out in our licence (<http://group.bmj.com/products/journals/instructions-for-authors/licence-forms>).

#### Competing Interest

Please see our policy and the unified Competing Interests form <http://resources.bmj.com/bmj/authors/editorial-policies/competing-interests>. Please state any competing interests if they exist, or make a no competing interests declaration.

#### Reviewer(s)' Comments to Author:

Reviewer: 1

Recommendation:

Comments:

The paper provides some useful information, although I believe it would be of interest to a small audience. I would not rate it as having a high importance for publication, as it could be made available on the WPRO website, for instance.

#### Additional Questions:

Please enter your name: Hellen Gelband

Job Title: Associate Director for Policy

Institution: Center for Disease Dynamics, Economics & Policy

Reimbursement for attending a symposium?: No

A fee for speaking?: No

A fee for organising education?: No

Funds for research?: Yes

Funds for a member of staff?: No

Fees for consulting?:

Have you in the past five years been employed by an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this paper?: No

Do you hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this paper?: No

If you have any competing interests [please see BMJ policy](http://www.bmj.com/about-bmj/resources-authors/forms-policies-and-checklists/declaration-competing-interests) please declare them here:

Reviewer: 2

Recommendation:

Comments:

In this article, the authors have described the development of a situation analysis tool to assess the achievements in containing antimicrobial resistance (AMR) with special focus on the developing countries in South East Asia.

With the rise in antimicrobial resistance and the lack of new approved antimicrobials, it has become imperative to be judicious in the prescription and consumption of antimicrobials. In this context, containment of AMR is utmost important and any attempt to understand this menace at multiple levels (global, national and local) is welcome. WHO has been at the forefront in this war against raising AMR and has initiated several studies to evaluate the prevalence and spread of AMR across the globe. Also, several guidelines have been released and AMR assessment tools have been developed for implementation over a period of time.

The proposed situation analysis tool is worth

implementing and the WHO team has identified six major indicators for system wide evaluation. Further, each of the indicators have been sub-classified to capture the information for robust data analysis and successful implementation of the Global action plan to contain AMR. The tool under discussion is aimed to cater to the development and implementation of the National Action plans with regards to the containment of AMR. Additionally, the tool overcomes the limitations of the previous 2 AMR containment tools i.e. Country situation analysis (CSA) and the Joint External Evaluation (JEE). However, the authors have not shared in detail any information about the limitations of this tool. Incorporation of the data from the pilot testing is recommended? What were the difficulties and the challenges they have come across during pilot testing? How well did the proposed tool fare in performance when compared to the previous 2 tools? In page 3, line 12 appears to be a repetition of the sentence from the previous paragraph. Also, on page 5, line 42, font size is different from the rest of the manuscript. The above mentioned comments are minor in nature and the manuscript may be approved.

Additional Questions:

Please enter your name: Bulagonda Eswarappa Pradeep

Job Title: Assistant Professor

Institution: Sri Sathya Sai Institute of Higher Learning

Reimbursement for attending a symposium?: No

A fee for speaking?: No

A fee for organising education?: No

Funds for research?: No

Funds for a member of staff?: No

Fees for consulting?: No

Have you in the past five years been employed by an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this paper?: No

Do you hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this paper?: No

If you have any competing interests <[A HREF='http://www.bmj.com/about-bmj/resources-authors/forms-policies-and-checklists/declaration-competing-interests' target='\\_new'](http://www.bmj.com/about-bmj/resources-authors/forms-policies-and-checklists/declaration-competing-interests)> (please see BMJ policy) </a> please declare them here: I am working on the prevalence and spread of antimicrobial resistance among clinically isolated bacterial pathogens. My group is involved in development of in-silico tools for the prediction of antibiotic resistance.

**Date Sent:** 27-Mar-2017