

30-Jan-2023

Why do retracted papers survive?

BMJ-2022-072929

Dear Dr. Boudry,

Thank you for giving us the opportunity to consider this paper, which we discussed at a recent Analysis Committee Meeting. Thanks also for your patience with our lengthy and uncharacteristic decision time; we do apologize for the delay.

We enjoyed reading this paper. The topic is important and we think it will be of interest to our readers. We are pleased to make a provisional offer of publication if you are able to address the questions, comments and requests for additional text in the attached.

As we have communicated to you in the past, we are very limited in the Analysis section as to the extent of original research we are able to publish. We are also limited in the length of papers we can publish in this section.

We have therefore edited your manuscript (using tracked changes) to: 1 present your findings in a way that is tenable for this section; 2 reduce the length of your paper and 3: bring out a more coherent, cohesive argument so as to fit the style and aims of our section.

We ask that you please carefully review our comments and edits, revise your paper and send it back to us within one month.

When you resubmit, please also provide:

- (a) A cover letter outlining how you have responded, or not responded and why, the editors' comments
- (b) A word count (excluding the references and words in boxes and tables). You should aim to keep this count below or very close to 2000 words.
- (c) Please check that all the information required in the manuscript (see note below) is included in the revised manuscript.

All accepted Analysis articles are published on [bmj.com](https://bmj.com), the canonical version of the journal. Some accepted Analysis articles will also be published in print. The BMJ might choose to shorten content or replace or re-size images for the print issue.

Please click this link to start the resubmission process: \*\*\* PLEASE NOTE: This is a two-step process. After clicking on the link, you will be directed to a webpage to confirm. \*\*\*

[https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/bmj?URL\\_MASK=2daa7dc8c41449cdab2cb58da2095e9a](https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/bmj?URL_MASK=2daa7dc8c41449cdab2cb58da2095e9a)

Alternatively, go to <https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/bmj> and login to your Author Center. Click on "Manuscripts with Decisions," and then click on "Create a Resubmission" located next to the manuscript number to upload and submit your revised manuscript.

**IMPORTANT:** Your original files are available to you when you upload your revised manuscript. Please delete any redundant files before completing the submission.

I hope you will find the comments useful and thank you for your continued time and effort on this paper,

Best wishes,

Adenike Odeleye

Clinical Editor  
aodeleye@bmj.com

-----

#### INFORMATION TO INCLUDE IN REVISION

Please would you also check that you have provided the following information:

- Competing interest statement (in the style explained at <http://www.bmj.com/about-bmj/resources-authors/forms-policies-and-checklists/declaration-competing-interests>; click on "Research" and please see "Examples competing interest statements")
- Contributorship statement + guarantor (<http://resources.bmj.com/bmj/authors/article-submission/authorship-contributorship>)
- Copyright statement/licence for publication (<http://www.bmj.com/about-bmj/resources-authors/forms-policies-and-checklists/copyright-open-access-and-permission-reuse>)
- Signed patient consent form(s), if the article gives enough personal information about any patient(s) ([http://resources.bmj.com/bmj/authors/editorial-policies/copy\\_of\\_patient-confidentiality](http://resources.bmj.com/bmj/authors/editorial-policies/copy_of_patient-confidentiality))

-----