

### Hayashi's criticism on previous Cochrane review<sup>6</sup>

Comments regarding oseltamivir's effects on complications

We have some questions on the conclusion in your Oseltamivir review especially about the prevention of complication. You described that "Oseltamivir 150 mg daily prevented lower respiratory tract complications (OR 0.32, 95% CI 0.18 to 0.57)." (in abstract).

However, we have found that this conclusion is based on the other review (Kaiser2003) and not on your own data analysis. The authors of the review were four employees of F. Hoffman-La Roche Ltd, one paid consultant to F. Hoffman-La Roche Ltd and Kaiser. We cannot find any raw data about this conclusion from your review. Kaiser's review included 10 RCTs; two RCTs (Nicholson 2000 and Treanor 2003\*) were published as articles in the peer-reviewed medical journal (JAMA and Lancet), but other 8 RCTs were proceedings of congress (5 RCTs), abstracts of the congress (one RCT) and meeting (one RCT) and data on file, Hoffmann-La Roche, Inc, Nutley, NJ (one RCT). The lower respiratory tract complication rates of these articles were summarized on table: there was no significant difference between Oseltamivir and placebo, and their Odds Ratio's (ORs) were 1.81. But ORs of other 8 RCTs were 4.37.

We strongly suppose that the reviewer's conclusion about the complications was mainly determined by these 8 RCTs, we should appraise the 8 trials rigidly. Without this process it's difficult to conclude that oseltamivir can prevent lower respiratory tract complications.

\*Treanor 2003 was cited by Hayashi, as given in the Kaiser 2003 paper; the correct year is 2000.

Complications	Placebo	Oseltamivir 75mg twice daily
+	12	3

-	278	279
---	-----	-----

Nicholson 2000 + Treanor 2000

Complications	Placebo	Oseltamivir 75mg twice daily
+	23	14
-	349	686

Other 8 RCTs

Complications	Placebo	Oseltamivir 75mg twice daily
+	35	17
-	627	965

As reported in Kaiser et al<sup>10</sup>

**Table: All lower respiratory tract complications (influenza case only)**

*Contributor: Keiji Hayashi Date of Submission: 14 July 2009*

some arithmetical errors have been corrected, and the data limited to oseltamivir 75mg twice daily as did Kaiser<sup>10</sup>