

Imperial College Healthcare NHS Trust, St Mary's Hospital, London, UK

simon.ashwort1@nhs.net Cite this as: *BMJ* 2021;375:n3050 http://dx.doi.org/10.1136/bmj.n3050 Published: 16 December 2021

## EFFECTIVENESS OF PUBLIC HEALTH MEASURES AGAINST COVID-19

## Effectiveness of public health measures against covid-19: ventilation has a major role

Simon Ashworth consultant and clinical director critical care

Talic and colleagues' systematic review and meta-analysis assessed many public health measures for reducing covid-19 but did not assess the effectiveness of interventions designed to reduce the presence of virus in inspired air, such as filtration, window opening, or the installation of ventilation.<sup>1</sup>

The climate implications of some of these measures could be challenging, but they are potentially important considerations in the design of buildings, workplaces, and homes for "antiviral sustainability." These factors are also potentially important modifiers for other measures like home isolation and social distancing or people density. In addition, ventilation may be a key determinant of the propensity for superspreading events, which seem to be a major determinant in the transmission of covid-19.

There is published evidence in this area—ventilation is an entire science in itself. It is also the subject of hospital building regulations,<sup>23</sup> World Health Organization guidance,<sup>4</sup> and government guidelines<sup>5</sup> from around the world. It has a major role in ensuring the safety of staff working in covid areas.<sup>6</sup>

Notwithstanding the understandable fears of clinical staff working directly with patients with covid-19, a lot of hospital based transmission of covid-19 is likely to take place in poorly ventilated non-clinical areas. In schools, variations in the effectiveness of closures may have related to differences in ventilation or climate (and hence window opening), which are potentially major determinants of school transmission and the safety of school returns.

With all this in mind, it is hard to understand why ventilation, high efficiency particulate air filtration,<sup>7</sup> ultraviolet disinfection,<sup>8</sup> and ambient carbon dioxide monitoring were not mentioned, especially in an article that seeks to inform policy. To deliver properly calibrated and effective responses to viral threats, surely it is important to understand the relative effectiveness and interactions between all the different measures?

Competing interests: None declared.

- 1 Talic S, Shah S, Wild H, etal. Effectiveness of public health measures in reducing the incidence of covid-19, SARS-CoV-2 transmission, and covid-19 mortality: systematic review and meta-analysis. *BMJ* 2021;375:e068302. doi: 10.1136/bmj-2021-068302 pmid: 34789505
- 2 American Society of Heating, Refrigerating, and Air Conditioning Engineers. ANSI/ASHRAE/ASHE standard 170-2017, ventilation of health care facilities. https://www.ashrae.org/technical-resources/standards-and-guidelines/standards-addenda/ansi-ashrae-ashe-standard-170-2017-ventilation-of-healthcare-facilities
- 3 Department of Health. Health building note 04-02. Critical care units. https://www.england.nhs.uk/wp-content/uploads/2021/05/HBN\_04-02\_Final.pdf

- 4 World Health Organization. Roadmap to improve and ensure good indoor ventilation in the context of covid-19. 1 Mar 2021. https://www.who.int/publications/i/item/9789240021280
- Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. Ventilation in buildings. https://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-ncov/community/ventilation.html
- 6 Kalliomäki P, Koskela H, Waris M, Tang JW. Assessing the risk to healthcare workers of hospital-acquired infection from patients infected with aerosol-transmissible pathogens. Institute of Occupational Safety and Health. 2020 https://iosh.com/media/8432/aerosol-infection-risk-hospitalpatient-care-full-report.pdf
- 7 Conway-Morris A, Sharrocks K, Bousfield R, etal. The removal of airborne SARS-CoV-2 and other microbial bioaerosols by air filtration on COVID-19 surge units.*medRxiv* 2021:2021.09.16.21263684. https://www.medrxiv.org/content/10.1101/2021.09.16.21263684v1
- 8 Davidson BL. Bare-bulb upper-room germicidal ultraviolet-c (guv) indoor air disinfection for covid-19. *Photochem Photobiol* 2021;97:524-6. doi: 10.1111/php.13380 pmid: 33438214
- 9 American Society of Heating, Refrigerating, and Air Conditioning Engineers. Coronavirus response resources. https://www.ashrae.org/technical-resources/resources

This article is made freely available for use in accordance with BMJ's website terms and conditions for the duration of the covid-19 pandemic or until otherwise determined by BMJ. You may use, download and print the article for any lawful, non-commercial purpose (including text and data mining) provided that all copyright notices and trade marks are retained.