



PA

● **HEAD TO HEAD**, p 18

NEWS

- 1 Cameron riles doctors by excluding critical voices from summit on controversial NHS changes
Row erupts over effect of plain packaging on prevalence of smoking
- 2 Chain of 30 kidney transplantations sets record
BMA warns of “private sector kicking GPs out of their surgeries” as NHS company takes over
- 3 Regulation of UK medical devices is criticised by manufacturers and by doctors who implant them
NHS picks up the bill for caring for private patients fitted with PIP implants
- 4 Water molecule movement may be key to monitoring ovarian cancer treatment
Bird flu research may be published within a year
- 5 Israel bans graduates of Al Quds University from taking exam to enable them to work in Israel
BMA calls for roll out of NHS 111 to be delayed
- 6 Obama’s plan to include contraception in healthcare provision provokes opposition from Catholics
Congressmen demand faster publication of trial data after *BMJ* campaign



Health reforms summit, p 1

RESEARCH

RESEARCH HIGHLIGHTS

- 11 The pick of *BMJ* research papers this week

RESEARCH NEWS

- 12 All you need to read in the other general journals

RESEARCH PAPERS

- 14 Effect of n-3 long chain polyunsaturated fatty acid supplementation in pregnancy on infants’ allergies in first year of life: randomised controlled trial
D J Palmer et al
- 15 Use of proton pump inhibitors and risk of hip fracture in relation to dietary and lifestyle factors: a prospective cohort study
Hamed Khalili et al
- 16 Understanding recent trends in incidence of invasive breast cancer in Norway: age-period-cohort analysis based on registry data on mammography screening and hormone treatment use
Harald Weedon-Fekjær et al
● **EDITORIAL**, p 7
- 17 Development and validation of PRE-DELIRIC (PREdiction of DELIRium in ICu patients) delirium prediction model for intensive care patients: observational multicentre study
M van den Boogaard et al
● **EDITORIAL**, p 8

COMMENT

EDITORIALS

- 7 The rise and fall of breast cancer rates
Karin B Michels
● **RESEARCH**, p 16



- 8 Delirium in intensive care patients
Valerie Page
● **RESEARCH**, p 17
- 9 Sudden death in epilepsy
Aidan Neligan et al
- 10 Proposals to increase the motorway speed limit by 10 mph
Jamie Lopez Bernal and Martin McKee

HEAD TO HEAD

- 18 Psychoanalysis: does it have a valuable place in modern mental health services?
Peter Fonagy and Alessandra Lemma say that the psychoanalytical approach can provide a useful and unique contribution to modern healthcare, but Paul Salkovskis and Lewis Wolpert argue that it has no place there at all

ANALYSIS

- 20 Hospital service reconfiguration: the battle for hearts and minds
Will Andrew Lansley’s four tests for reconfiguration make decisions less controversial? Helen Barratt and Rosalind Raine discuss the challenges they raise
- 23 GP led commissioning: time for a cool appraisal
The government has identified GP led commissioning as critical to tackling the twin challenges of service change and improved efficiency, but does the evidence bear this out? Judith Smith and Nicholas Mays investigate



Changing the tune on reconfiguration, p 20

Articles appearing in this print journal have already been published on bmj.com, and the version in print may have been shortened. bmj.com also contains material that is supplementary to articles: this will be indicated in the text (references are given as w1, w2, etc) and be labelled as extra on bmj.com.

Please cite all articles by year, volume, and elocator (rather than page number), eg *BMJ* 2012; 344:d286.

A note on how to cite each article appears at the end of each article, and this is the form the reference will take in PubMed and other indexes.

100% recycled

The *BMJ* is printed on 100% recycled paper (except the cover)



Patrick Mollison obituary, p 35

COMMENT

LETTERS

- 26 Acanthamoeba keratitis
NICE on organ donation
- 27 The greening of medicine
Managing hypertension
Clinical prediction rules
- 28 Net harms of breast screening
Too late to stop the bill?

OBSERVATIONS

BODY POLITIC

- 30 Seeing through the alcohol statistics haze
Nigel Hawkes

MEDICINE AND THE MEDIA

- 31 "One in four": the anatomy of a statistic
Stephen Ginn, Jamie Horder

VIEWS AND
REVIEWS

PERSONAL VIEW

- 32 I don't need my
own office
Nadeem Moghal

REVIEW OF THE
WEEK

- 33 Intelligent Kindness:
Reforming the
Culture of Healthcare
by John Ballatt and
Penelope Campling
Iona Heath

BETWEEN THE LINES

- 34 And in this manner he died Theodore Dalrymple

MEDICAL CLASSICS

- 34 Tommy David Ingle



OBITUARIES

- 35 Patrick Mollison, and others

LAST WORDS

- 51 Exploiting non-communicable disease Des Spence
Doctors in Dickens Wendy Moore

EDUCATION



CLINICAL REVIEW

- 37 Managing retinal vein occlusion
Christine A Kiire and N Victor Chong

PRACTICE

THERAPEUTICS

- 44 Hormone replacement therapy
Martha Hickey et al

ENDGAMES

- 50 Quiz page for doctors in training

MINERVA

- 52 Extramammary Paget's disease, and other stories

FILLER

- 49 Those who cannot remember the past are
condemned to repeat it

The Editor, *BMJ*
 BMA House, Tavistock Square,
 London WC1H 9JR
 Email: editor@bmj.com
 Tel: +44 (0)20 7387 4410
 Fax: +44 (0)20 7383 6418
BMA MEMBERS' INQUIRIES
 Email: membership@bma.org.uk
 Tel: +44 (0)20 7383 6642
BMJ CAREERS ADVERTISING
 Email: sales@bmjcareers.com
 Tel: +44 (0)20 7383 6531
DISPLAY ADVERTISING
 Email: sales@bmjgroup.com
 Tel: +44 (0)20 7383 6386
REPRINTS
 UK/Rest of world
 Email: ngurneyrandall@bmjgroup.com
 Tel: +44 (0)20 8445 5825
 USA
 Email: mfogler@medicalreprints.com
 Tel: +1 (856) 489 4446
SUBSCRIPTIONS
 BMA Members
 Email: membership@bma.org.uk
 Tel: +44 (0)20 7383 6642
 Non-BMA Members
 Email: support@bmjgroup.com
 Tel: +44 (0)20 7383 6270
OTHER RESOURCES
 For all other contacts:
 resources.bmj.com/bmj/contact-us
 For advice to authors:
 resources.bmj.com/bmj/authors
 To submit an article:
 submit.bmj.com



The *BMJ* is published by BMJ Publishing Group Ltd, a wholly owned subsidiary of the British Medical Association.

The BMA grants editorial freedom to the Editor of the *BMJ*. The views expressed in the journal are those of the authors and may not necessarily comply with BMA policy. The *BMJ* follows guidelines on editorial independence produced by the World Association of Medical Editors (www.wame.org/wamestmt.htm#independence) and the code on good publication practice produced by the Committee on Publication Ethics (www.publicationethics.org.uk/guidelines/).

The *BMJ* is intended for medical professionals and is provided without warranty, express or implied. Statements in the journal are the responsibility of their authors and advertisers and not authors' institutions, the *BMJ* Publishing Group, or the BMA unless otherwise specified or determined by law. Acceptance of advertising does not imply endorsement.

To the fullest extent permitted by law, the *BMJ* Publishing Group shall not be liable for any loss, injury, or damage resulting from the use of the *BMJ* or any information in it whether based on contract, tort, or otherwise. Readers are advised to verify any information they choose to rely on.

©BMJ Publishing Group Ltd 2012 All Rights Reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any other means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without prior permission, in writing, of the *BMJ*

Published weekly. US periodicals class postage paid at Rahway, NJ. Postmaster: send address changes to *BMJ*, c/o Mercury Airfreight International Ltd Inc, 365 Blair Road, Avenel, NJ 07001, USA. \$796.

Weekly
 Printed by Polestar Limited

Aug. 15-16
 STATE OF OHIO
 Rick Fluzumanti (donor) to a recipient (recipient's name not known). It is implanted in a 60-year-old man who has a willing donor with an incompatible kidney.

Aug. 16-17
 The recipient's donor gives her kidney to a man who does not know it at a hospital in Madison, Wis. The chain continues to ring across the country.

Sept. 21-23

Dec. 5-6

Dec. 7

Aug. 30-31

Sept. 27-28

Dec. 5-7

Dec. 19-20

NEW YORK TIMES/REDUX/EVEMINE

PICTURE OF THE WEEK

Chain gang: a record chain of 30 kidney transplantations involving 60 people has been set in the United States. The chain began with an altruistic donation in August last year and ended in December.

NEWS, p 2

bmj.com

Head to Head: Is it unethical for doctors to encourage healthy adults to donate a kidney to a stranger?

BMJ 2011;343:d7179 and d7140

Clinical Review: Renal transplantation. BMJ 2011;343:d7300

BMJ.COM POLL

Last week we asked, "Should we use elective ventilation to increase organ donation?"

66% voted yes (total 476 votes cast)

This week's poll asks, "Should journals allow peer review only after publication?"

bmj.com Cast your vote

BMJ GROUP AWARDS

DON'T MISS YOUR LAST CHANCE TO ENTER!

Visit groupawards.bmj.com to register, view each category criteria, and submit your work using the new user friendly online submission system.

Don't delay—entries close on the 28 February. Winners will be announced at a glittering ceremony held at the London Hilton on Park Lane on Wednesday, 23 May 2012.

EDITOR'S CHOICE

A modern approach to mental health

Poor mental health is often rooted in inequality, conflict, overcrowding, lack of rights, lack of financial security, and poor living conditions—which tablets don't treat

Does psychoanalysis have a place in modern medicine? Peter Fonagy and Alessandra Lemma do their best to make the case that it does. They argue that evidence of its usefulness is “on its way,” that it continues to enhance therapeutic relationships, that it's central to our understanding of the influence of early life experience, and that it is the basis for cognitive behavioural therapy (p 18). But for my money they are outflanked by Paul Salkovskis and Lewis Wolpert. Psychoanalysis has had its day, these critics say. It should be given credit for establishing a new paradigm over a century ago, but it has now been supplanted by other concepts that better explain and improve people's mental state. Continuing to act on such outdated theories would not be tolerated in cardiology or oncology, they say.

More than this, they suggest that psychoanalysis carries dangers for modern healthcare, calling it a pseudoscience whose claims can't be tested or refuted. They say it has always resisted the idea of evaluating outcomes and of diagnosing and treating symptoms. And it's expensive. They contrast this with the real improvements in mental healthcare that have come from greater accountability on both the outcomes and costs of treatment through bodies such as the UK's National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence.

Helen Lester and Simon Gilbody confirm this progress, with caveats. In their editorial on bmj.com (doi 10.1136/bmj.e1014), they remind us that it's now 25 years since the first SSRI, fluoxetine, was licensed. Patients and clinicians now have available to them a potentially confusing array of second generation antidepressants. Since evidence suggests that little difference exists between them in effectiveness, decisions should now be made on the cost and side effect profiles of different drugs.

Importantly, the authors stress that the latest systematic review of 234 studies in people with major depression shows that second generation antidepressants do work. This evidence counters widely publicised claims made in a meta-analysis, published in *PLoS Medicine* in 2008, that they had little or no effect except in people with the most severe depression. Such claims may well have dissuaded patients and some clinicians from considering or continuing antidepressants. It's good to see them countered here.

Efforts to change attitudes towards mental health problems continue. A new campaign says “It's time to talk.” But Stephen Ginn and Jamie Horder spot difficulties with the much quoted figure that one in four people experience mental health problems (p 31). Is this a lifetime, yearly, or point prevalence? The evidence in fact suggests a higher figure and several prevalence studies point to a lifetime prevalence of nearer 50%.

Whatever the true burden of poor mental health in the UK and internationally, it is certainly considerable. And it is concentrated among poor and marginalised groups. While acknowledging important progress in modern treatments, we should remember the dangers of adopting a strict medical model. Poor mental health is often rooted in inequality, conflict, overcrowding, lack of rights, lack of financial security, and poor living conditions—which tablets don't treat. Unless social and economic determinants are addressed (a very big task), poor mental health and the stigma it attracts will continue unabated.

Fiona Godlee, editor, *BMJ*
fgodlee@bmj.com

Cite this as: *BMJ* 2012;344:e1322

Twitter

► Follow the editor, Fiona Godlee, at twitter.com/fgodlee and the *BMJ*'s latest at twitter.com/bmj_latest

Join your
colleagues.

BMJ Masterclasses

masterclasses.bmj.com

